To: "Lipke, Sheldon" [slipke@PVSC.COM]

"abaptista@ironboundcc.org" [abaptista@ironboundcc.org]; akruger@verizon.net" Cc: [akruger@verizon.net]; Slagle, Ashley" [ASlagle@PVSC.com]; bfixter@cleanearthinc.com" [bfixter@cleanearthinc.com]; McKenna, Bridget" [BMcKenna@PVSC.COM]; carlie.thompson@tierrainc.com" [carlie.thompson@tierra-inc.com]; caroljsc@aol.com" [caroljsc@aol.com]; cefirstenberg@cox.net" [cefirstenberg@cox.net]; debbie@nynjbaykeeper.org" [debbie@nynjbaykeeper.org]; fengh@mail.montclair.edu" [fengh@mail.montclair.edu]; N=Gabriela Munoz/OU=R2/O=USEPA/C=US@EPA; "gosaid@ci.newark.nj.us" [gosaid@ci.newark.nj.us]; gosaid@ci.newark.nj.us" [gosaid@ci.newark.nj.us]; harvey.morginstin@gmail.com" [harvey.morginstin@gmail.com]; heimbuch@demaximis.com" [heimbuch@demaximis.com]; info@hackensackriverkeeper.org" [info@hackensackriverkeeper.org]; jen.hudon@gmail.com" [jen.hudon@gmail.com]; jim@hudsonriver.org" [jim@hudsonriver.org]; ohn Burns [jjburns@cox.net]; jonathan@jaffecom.com" [jonathan@jaffecom.com]; jtripp@environmentaldefense.org" [itripp@environmentaldefense.org]; kirk.barrett@manhattan.edu" [kirk.barrett@manhattan.edu]; llevine@nrdc.org" [llevine@nrdc.org]; mail@nynjbaykeeper.org" [mail@nynjbaykeeper.org]; maribel@jerseyhistory.org" [maribel@jerseyhistory.org]; mick@glec-tc.com" [mick@glec-tc.com]; mmasters@panynj.gov" [mmasters@panynj.gov]; mseeburger@coughlinduffy.com" [mseeburger@coughlinduffy.com]; ophorid@mail.montclair.edu" [ophorid@mail.montclair.edu]; otto@demaximis.com" [otto@demaximis.com]; prcwater@aol.com" [prcwater@aol.com]; richda@ci.newark.nj.us" [richda@ci.newark.nj.us]; rjwenning@environcorp.com" [rjwenning@environcorp.com]; rlaw@demaximis.com" [rlaw@demaximis.com]; rromagnoli@bbl-inc.com" [rromagnoli@bbl-inc.com]; rsiegel@panyni.gov" [rsiegel@panyni.gov]; science@cleanoceanaction.org" [science@cleanoceanaction.org]; shahn@ghcci.com" [shahn@ghcci.com]; sheller@panynj.gov" [sheller@panynj.gov]; Newark - Sherban, Christian" [Sherbanc@ci.newark.nj.us]; simaresc@gw.dec.state.ny.us" [simaresc@gw.dec.state.ny.us]; stephenluftig@aol.com" [stephenluftig@aol.com]; stsinger@verizon.net" [stsinger@verizon.net]; vmagar@environcorp.com" [vmagar@environcorp.com]; wd@dischconstruction.com" [wd@dischconstruction.com]; aughn.Stephanie@epamail.epa.gov[]

Bcc:

From: CN=Alice Yeh/OU=R2/O=USEPA/C=US

**Sent:** Thur 12/8/2011 8:59:41 PM

Subject: RE: Passaic River-Newark Bay PDT meeting

As we discussed yesterday, the format of the PDT meetings and how they are run are completely unrelated to the Cooperating Parties Group (CPG). EPA and the Partner Agencies set the agendas for the PDT meeting without consulting the CPG.

You may be recalling the "Remedial Options Work Groups" and "Restoration Work Groups" that we used to convene, back when EPA was first formulating the alternatives for the FFS and USACE was first formulating the restoration options for the FERP. Back then, it was appropriate to discuss alternative formulation and restoration options in technical detail with all of our stakeholders. However, now that the FFS is set as far as the alternatives that are included, and now that the FERP is set as far as the restoration options that are included (except for any public comment periods that EPA and USACE are undergoing now or have yet to undergo), we have not called any of those work groups back together.

As to detailed technical presentations on the data collected by the CPG, EPA does not feel that we are ready to do that in a public forum like the PDT yet. The data are still coming in and we (the Partner Agencies) have not even gotten our arms fully around them yet.

I just wanted to make absolutely clear that responsibility for the format of the PDT meetings and how they are run rests solely with EPA and the Partner Agencies, not anyone else - certainly not the CPG.

From: "Lipke, Sheldon" <slipke@PVSC.COM>

To: Alice Yeh/R2/USEPA/US@EPA, "Slagle, Ashley" <ASlagle@PVSC.com>, "McKenna, Bridget"

```
<BMcKenna@PVSC.COM>, "carlie.thompson@tierra-inc.com" <carlie.thompson@tierra-inc.com>,
"cefirstenberg@cox.net" <cefirstenberg@cox.net>, "mick@glec-tc.com" <mick@glec-tc.com>, John
Burns < jjburns@cox.net>, "jonathan@jaffecom.com" < jonathan@jaffecom.com>,
"heimbuch@demaximis.com" <heimbuch@demaximis.com>, "rlaw@demaximis.com"
<rlaw@demaximis.com>, "rromagnoli@bbl-inc.com" <rromagnoli@bbl-inc.com>,
"stephenluftig@aol.com" <stephenluftig@aol.com>, "otto@demaximis.com" <otto@demaximis.com>,
"abaptista@ironboundcc.org" <abaptista@ironboundcc.org>, "akruger@verizon.net"
<a kruger@verizon.net>, "carolisc@aol.com" <carolisc@aol.com>, "Newark - Sherban, Christian"
<Sherbanc@ci.newark.nj.us>, "richda@ci.newark.nj.us" <richda@ci.newark.nj.us>,
"debbie@nynjbaykeeper.org" <debbie@nynjbaykeeper.org>, "gosaid@ci.newark.nj.us"
<qosaid@ci.newark.ni.us>, "ophorid@mail.montclair.edu" <ophorid@mail.montclair.edu>,
"prcwater@aol.com" cwater@aol.com>, Gabriela Munoz/R2/USEPA/US@EPA,
"harvey.morginstin@gmail.com" <harvey.morginstin@gmail.com>, "fengh@mail.montclair.edu"
<fengh@mail.montclair.edu>, "info@hackensackriverkeeper.org" <info@hackensackriverkeeper.org>,
"jen.hudon@gmail.com" <jen.hudon@gmail.com>, "science@cleanoceanaction.org"
<science@cleanoceanaction.org>, "jim@hudsonriver.org" <jim@hudsonriver.org>,
"jtripp@environmentaldefense.org" <jtripp@environmentaldefense.org>, "kirk.barrett@manhattan.edu"
<a href="mailto:kirk.barrett@manhattan.edu">kirk.barrett@manhattan.edu</a>, "llevine@nrdc.org" <llevine@nrdc.org", "maribel@jerseyhistory.org"
<maribel@jerseyhistory.org>, "mmasters@panynj.gov" <mmasters@panynj.gov>,
"mseeburger@coughlinduffy.com" <mseeburger@coughlinduffy.com>, "rjwenning@environcorp.com"
<rijwenning@environcorp.com>, "bfixter@cleanearthinc.com" <br/> <br/>
"rsiegel@panynj.gov" <rsiegel@panynj.gov>, "sheller@panynj.gov" <sheller@panynj.gov>,
"shahn@ghcci.com" <shahn@ghcci.com>, "stsinger@verizon.net" <stsinger@verizon.net>,
"simaresc@gw.dec.state.ny.us" <simaresc@gw.dec.state.ny.us>, "mail@nynjbaykeeper.org"
<mail@nynjbaykeeper.org>, "vmagar@environcorp.com" <vmagar@environcorp.com>,
"wd@dischconstruction.com" <wd@dischconstruction.com>
Date: 12/08/2011 11:49 AM
```

Alice, The PDT meetings at the beginnings of the program consisted of many technical briefings of different aspects of the programs. When the program was taken over by the Cooperating Parties, the transparency that was in place when EPA ran the program was lost. The meetings now consist mainly of short updates on a few of the ongoing tasks in the program. An example is the work being performed in RM 10. We have never been given a technical presentation of the findings leading to the need to conduct the work and why it is being done. Also, we don't want to wait until each work task is completed for the results, but would like to share the data and conclusions as the work is progressing. Another example is the second source of Dioxin paper. Such an important finding should be presented before the PDT in addition to the sediment conferences which few can attend. In summary, I think we should have more beef, and less fluff at the meetings. You and your staff have done an outstanding job at these meetings and they serve a major role in keeping the more technical minded public informed on the project.

RE: Passaic River-Newark Bay PDT meeting

Subject:

From: Yeh.Alice@epamail.epa.gov [mailto:Yeh.Alice@epamail.epa.gov]
Sent: Wednesday, December 07, 2011 3:07 PM
To: Slagle, Ashley; McKenna, Bridget; carlie.thompson@tierra-inc.com; cefirstenberg@cox.net; mick@glec-tc.com; John Burns; jonathan@jaffecom.com; heimbuch@demaximis.com; rlaw@demaximis.com; rromagnoli@bbl-inc.com; Lipke, Sheldon; StephenLuftig@aol.com; otto@demaximis.com; abaptista@ironboundcc.org; AKruger@verizon.net; caroljsc@aol.com; Newark-Sherban, Christian; richda@ci.newark.nj.us; debbie@nynjbaykeeper.org; gosaid@ci.newark.nj.us; ophorid@mail.montclair.edu; PRCWater@aol.com; Munoz.Gabriela@epa.gov; harvey.morginstin@gmail.com; fengh@mail.montclair.edu; info@hackensackriverkeeper.org; jen.hudon@gmail.com; Science@CleanOceanAction.org; jim@hudsonriver.org; jtripp@environmentaldefense.org; kirk.barrett@manhattan.edu; llevine@nrdc.org; Maribel@JerseyHistory.Org; mmasters@panynj.gov; mseeburger@coughlinduffy.com; rjwenning@environcorp.com; bfixter@cleanearthinc.com; rsiegel@panynj.gov; sheller@panynj.gov;

shahn@ghcci.com; stsinger@verizon.net; simaresc@gw.dec.state.ny.us; mail@nynjbaykeeper.org; vmagar@environcorp.com; WD@DischConstruction.com Subject: Passaic River-Newark Bay PDT meeting

To those of you who attended today's Passaic River-Newark Bay Project Delivery Team (PDT) meeting, attached is the sign-in sheet.

Attendance at these PDT meetings has been declining, and discussions have dwindled as well. We really would rather not waste your time holding meetings that are not useful to you. So if you have any feedback on whether we should keep scheduling these meetings, or whether we should just cancel them until there is something substantial to present, please send me an e-mail or give me a call at 212-637-4427, or contact any of the other Partner Agency project managers (Elizabeth Butler, Eugenia Naranjo, Stephanie Vaughn, Janine MacGregor, Lisa Baron, Reyhan Mehran, Tim Kubiak) at the e-mails or phone numbers listed in the sign-in sheet attached above.